

**MINUTES OF THE
EDUCATION INTERIM COMMITTEE**

Wednesday, November 18, 2015 – 8:00 a.m. – Room 30 House Building

Members Present:

Sen. Ann Millner, Senate Chair
Rep. Bradley G. Last, House Chair
Sen. Jim Dabakis
Sen. Aaron Osmond
Sen. Howard A. Stephenson
Rep. LaVar Christensen
Rep. Bruce R. Cutler
Rep. Steve Eliason
Rep. Justin L. Fawson
Rep. David E. Lifferth
Rep. Daniel McCay
Rep. Carol Spackman Moss
Rep. Michael E. Noel
Rep. Marie H. Poulson
Rep. V. Lowry Snow

Members Absent:

Sen. Stephen H. Urquhart
Rep. Francis D. Gibson
Speaker Gregory H. Hughes
Rep. Eric K. Hutchings

Staff Present:

Ms. Tiffany A. Stanley, Policy Analyst
Ms. Allyson R. Goldstein, Policy Analyst
Ms. Victoria Ashby, Associate General Counsel
Ms. Tracy J. Nuttall, Associate General Counsel
Ms. Rebekah Bradway, Associate General Counsel
Ms. Debra Hale, Legislative Assistant

Note: A list of others present, a copy of related materials, and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at www.le.utah.gov.

1. Committee Business

Chair Millner called the meeting to order at 8:17 a.m. Rep. Gibson was excused from the meeting.

MOTION: Sen. Dabakis moved to approve the minutes of the October 21, 2015, and October 29, 2015, meetings. The motion passed unanimously. Sen. Stephenson, Rep. Christensen, Rep. Cutler, Rep. Eliason, Rep. Last, and Rep. McCay were absent for the vote.

2. Optional School Readiness Programs for At-Risk Children

Chair Millner provided an overview of the agenda item and relinquished the chair to Rep. Last.

Mr. Tom Van Gorder, Assistant Superintendent, Park City School District, presented "Pre-School End of Year Report – June 2015." He reviewed how Park City School District evaluates the district's preschool program and the results of the program on student achievement.

Ms. Nannette Barnes, Assistant Director, Preschool Services, Granite School District, presented "School Readiness – High Quality Programs for Sustained Results." She reviewed how Granite School District evaluates the district's preschool program and the results of the program on student achievement. She also explained the fee structure the district uses to provide access to preschool for those who do not qualify based on income.

Dr. Richard K. Nye, Associate Superintendent, Accountability and Assessment, Utah State Office of Education, discussed recent research regarding the longitudinal impact of preschool on student achievement. Specifically, he referenced a Vanderbilt University study on Tennessee's voluntary preschool program.

Sen. Millner distributed and reviewed a draft legislation proposal, "High Quality School Readiness Program Expansion," which would expand access to high-quality school readiness programs for at-risk four-year-olds.

The committee provided input on the draft legislation proposal.

3. Charter School Funding Task Force Report

Sen. Stephenson and Rep. Eliason, as cochairs of the Charter School Funding Task Force, reviewed the statutory duties of the task force as outlined in 2015 General Session H.B. 444, "Charter School Funding Task Force." They also reviewed issues the task force had discussed in 2015 and potential outcomes of the task force's work.

4. Career and Technical Education (CTE) Legislative Audits

A Review of CTE Coordination and Program Duplication between Public Education and the Utah College of Applied Technology (Report #2015-09)

Mr. Richard D. Coleman, Deputy Auditor General, Office of the Legislative Auditor General, and Mr. David A. Gibson, Audit Supervisor, Office of the Legislative Auditor General, reviewed "Audit Report #2015-09 – A Review of CTE Coordination and Program Duplication between Public Education and UCAT." They explained that, in general, CTE coordination appears adequate, and duplication of effort is not widespread. Nevertheless, they recommended that the State Board of Education and the Utah College of Applied Technology (UCAT) Board of Trustees:

- explore opportunities to increase students' utilization of applied technology colleges (ATCs);
- develop policies for reviewing articulation agreements;
- create policies to ensure that secondary students receive credit for CTE classes taken in the evening or during the summer at ATCs; and
- encourage local education agency boards and ATC boards of directors to review potential duplication and determine how to more effectively utilize available resources, particularly those through ATCs.

Ms. Thalea Longhurst, Director, Career and Technical Education, Utah State Office of Education (USOE), responded to the audit. She noted the importance of understanding that the State Board of Education has little direct authority over local education agencies in terms of scheduling, but that USOE is working to educate them on opportunities and responsibilities. Ms. Longhurst stated that USOE is working to address the recommendations within the audit, including developing policies for articulation agreements and working with local education agencies to improve collaboration among local education agencies and ATCs.

Mr. Rob Brems, President, Utah College of Applied Technology (UCAT), stated that the college is appreciative of the information contained in the audit. Mr. Brems addressed the recommendations within the audit and reported that the UCAT Board of Trustees has appointed a committee to review credit and articulation issues and progress made to avoid duplication.

A Performance Audit of CTE Completion and Job Placement Rates (Report #2015-11)

Mr. Timothy K. Bereece, Audit Supervisor, Legislative Auditor General, reviewed "Audit Report #2015-11 – A Performance Audit of CTE Completion and Job Placement Rates." He explained that broad

completion definitions make composite statistics not comparable. Specifically, he reported that student outcomes considered as completion are not the same between UCAT and the Utah System for Higher Education: each system's programs differ greatly in length, UCAT has diluted its completion statistics with small achievements, and the Utah System for Higher Education does not report CTE completions as a rate. He also explained that job placement rates are not comparable, because providers of CTE use different methods to determine the rates.

Mr. Brems expressed gratitude for the quality of the audit report. He addressed the findings and recommendations within the audit and indicated that UCAT essentially agrees with the recommendations and is taking action to address them.

Dr. David L. Buhler, Commissioner of Higher Education, Utah System of Higher Education, also expressed gratitude for the report and addressed the findings and recommendations within the audit. He noted that the Utah System for Higher Education uses the most accurate data available in its reporting and is taking action to address the recommendations within the audit.

Sen. Stephenson requested a recommendation from the State Board of Education on how the state can make attainment of a CTE certificate in high school as paramount as completion of an associate degree.

5. Report on the Impact of Certain Funds on Class Size

This agenda item was not addressed.

6. Early College High Schools (Draft Legislation)

This agenda item was not addressed.

7. Other Items/Adjourn

MOTION: Rep. McCay moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion passed unanimously. Rep. Christensen, Rep. Eliason, and Rep. Snow were absent for the vote.

Chair Last adjourned the meeting at 11:07 a.m.